



Understanding the Dynamics of Product Diversification on Microfinance Performance Outcomes: A Case Study in Barbados

Koen Rossel-Cambier

This paper aims at gaining deeper understanding of the possible effects of combined microfinance (CMF) on social and economic performance outcomes. By means of a case-study on the City of Bridgetown (COB), one of the leading credit unions in Barbados, it explores the possible limits, challenges and economies of scope of CMF. This case-study suggests that CMF, especially the combination credit-savings, may enhance the cost-efficiency of loan delivery and that it can generate economies of scope for marketing purposes. Savings is at the heart of the growth strategy of the credit union and has contributed to its current large breadth of outreach. The paper observes that more female than male clients participate in insurance schemes, highlighting gender differences. The case-study suggests that CMF can also lead to a number of combined and additional costs and financial risks, which need to be taken into account. The nature of product diversification can lead to additional access barriers for unbankable clients, especially related to financial costs and information asymmetry.

Keywords: microfinance, combined microfinance, microinsurance, microcredit, microsavings, poverty, social inclusion, Caribbean

JEL Classifications: C12, G21, G22, L31, O54

CEB Working Paper N° 11/008
2011

Understanding the Dynamics of Product Diversification on Microfinance Performance Outcomes: A Case Study in Barbados

Koen Rossel-Cambier¹

This paper aims at gaining deeper understanding of the possible effects of combined microfinance (CMF) on social and economic performance outcomes. By means of a case-study on the City of Bridgetown (COB), one of the leading credit unions in Barbados, it explores the possible limits, challenges and economies of scope of CMF. This case-study suggests that CMF, especially the combination credit-savings, may enhance the cost-efficiency of loan delivery and that it can generate economies of scope for marketing purposes. Savings is at the heart of the growth strategy of the credit union and has contributed to its current large breadth of outreach. The paper observes that more female than male clients participate in insurance schemes, highlighting gender differences. The case-study suggests that CMF can also lead to a number of combined and additional costs and financial risks, which need to be taken into account. The nature of product diversification can lead to additional access barriers for unbankable clients, especially related to financial costs and information asymmetry.

Keywords: *microfinance, combined microfinance, microinsurance, microcredit, microsavings, poverty, social inclusion, Caribbean*

JEL: *C12, G21, G22, L31, O54*

¹ The author thanks Mrs. Glendon S.Bell and Algie Yearwood of the City of Bridgetown Co-operative Credit Union for sharing their insights on the cooperative movement in Barbados.

Introduction

Over the last decades, microfinance institutions (MFIs) have become instruments allowing access to financial services for unbankable populations. From a sustainability point of view, MFIs need to achieve economic performance to ensure that they can continue providing their services over the long term. A poverty outreach point of view stresses the importance of social performance in order to ensure the mission of most MFIs: improving the living conditions of unbankable and low-income populations. While providing pro-poor financing plans, the various MFIs have extended their range of services beyond loan instruments to savings and insurance products. A key question is how the delivery of multiple financial services -or combined microfinance (CMF) - may influence the economic or social performance of MFIs. CMF may contribute to the achievement of various economies of scope but can also entail economic risks for the organisations. Customers may expect to be better served when being offered a wider range of services meeting their diverse business development needs, but the difficulty accessing CMF may lead to more exclusion of low income persons.

Barbados is the easternmost English-speaking Island in the Caribbean and has a population of 294,000 inhabitants (UN Data online, year 2007). Its main sectors are agriculture, construction, financial services and tourism, but there is a strong presence of small and medium enterprises (Hossain, Knight and Arun, 2009). Barbados has over the decades been able to develop a respectable level of human development (UNDP, 2009), but is still confronted with varying levels of social vulnerability. The promotion of microfinance -and in particular the cooperative movement- is reported to have played a major contribution to the socio-economic achievements of the island. With a view to gain deeper understanding on the experience of CMF in this small island development state many questions come to mind; Is CMF actively practiced in the microfinance sector?; Does CMF contribute to the economic performance of microfinance delivery?; Does CMF play a role in enhancing poverty outreach?.

Previous empirical surveys have explored quantitative evidence on the possible effects of CMF on respectively the economic and the social performance of MFIs (Rossel-Cambier, 2010a and 2010b). It is important to gain deeper understanding of what issues are at stake

for CMF in Barbados and – from a broader perspective- get a better grasp in qualitative terms of some of the key assumptions and findings from existing literature. This paper aims at generating in-depth knowledge on the effects of CMF by providing qualitative data extracted from a case-study involving various stakeholders around the cooperative City of Bridgetown (COB) in Barbados.

This paper is organised as follows. The second and third sections describe respectively the methodology and the various research hypotheses. Section 4 reviews the presence and characteristics of CMF in Barbados. The following section reviews how the City of Bridgetown, a Barbadian credit union, applies CMF. Sections 6 and 7 review the possible effects of CMF on the respective economic and social performance of the COB. The final section proposes conclusions on the findings and offers a number of recommendations.

2. Methodology

The main objective of this paper is to gain greater understanding of the possible effects of CMF on the economic and social performance of MFIs. It aims at providing qualitative evidence -from a case-study in Barbados- on the possible risks, challenges and economies of scope which are generated by the provision of multiple financial products.

Taking into account a stakeholders-oriented conceptual framework on combined microfinance (Rossel-Cambier, 2008), this paper aims at gaining greater understanding of CMF and refers to three complementary research papers involving cross-sectional analysis of 250 MFIs in Latin America and the Caribbean. These papers deal with the presence and characteristics of combined microfinance (Rossel-Cambier, 2009), the effects of CMF on the economic performance (Rossel-Cambier, 2010a) and social performance (Rossel-Cambier, 2010b) of MFIs.

This case-study aims at getting a better grasp and qualitative information on the issues and questions suggested in these three empirical studies the findings and –for the sake of transparency- presents them as hypotheses.

Findings in Barbados are relevant as the country is no exception to the microfinance and cooperative experience in the Caribbean region. Certainly, its characteristics of a small island development state with a relatively high human development and respectable level of public governance may deviate from other selected Caribbean and Latin American countries (Parks and Rossel-Cambier, 2008). The City of Bridgetown credit union was selected for this case study because of its active involvement in multiple financial product delivery and its relevant focus on both social and economic results. The COB is one of the largest credit unions on the island and, contrary to other large unions which focus on wage workers, also includes a significant portion of self employed persons, both from low and middle income groups. As the credit union has reached a certain level of professionalization with staffing reaching over 100 employees, some of the findings may not be applicable for smaller or more informal MFIs.

This paper builds on primary data collection by means of multiple stakeholder consultations. Annex 1 reflects the questionnaire used for semi-structured interviews with MFI managers. Annex 2 presents the guiding questionnaire used for in-depth interviews with clients. This paper was prepared during the period February 2010-February 2011 and involves structured in-depth interviews with about 65 stakeholders including MFI managers, government officials, clients and promoters. Annex 4 gives an overview of the key stakeholders consulted.

This case-study also refers to secondary data from the limited literature available on microfinance and credit unions in Barbados and the Eastern Caribbean. A number of country-wide assessments, corporate reports and relevant websites allow better understanding of the context and the functioning of the various MFI institutions and their products. The paper takes into account the legislation and the socio-economic literature about the overall context of MFIs and in particular credit unions in Barbados.

3. Hypotheses

This paper aims at gaining greater understanding of three complementary research questions: Is combined microfinance a significant reality in Barbados?; What are the effects of CMF on the economic performance of the COB?; and; How could CMF influence the social performance of COB?.

To what extent is CMF a reality in Barbados? A survey in Latin America and the Caribbean (Rossel-Cambier, 2009) observes that the majority, 56% of the MFIs in Latin America and the Caribbean, combine various financial products. 17% of the schemes offer credit and savings, 18% offer credit and insurance (no savings) and 21% provide credit, insurance and savings products. The survey finds that cooperatives and banks actively apply CMF while NGOs are more oriented to microcredit only. Considering these findings as a first hypothesis (H1), this paper will explore if also in Barbados the majority of the MFIs are combined in nature and will comment on their main characteristics.

From a stakeholder's framework point of view, the organisation and the clients are the key players at the micro level. Our second research question deals with the point of view of the MFIs and aims at gathering knowledge on the way CMF could influence its economic performance. A study using cross-sectional empirical data (Rossel-Cambier, 2010), building on 7500 observations from 250 MFIs from the fiscal year 2006, compares the economic performance of MFIs offering credit only with those combining credit with respectively savings and insurance. By using multiple regression analysis, the research suggests a positive effect of savings and insurance on the efficiency and productivity of MFIs. While reviewing this finding which can be considered as a second hypothesis (H2), this paper aims at providing knowledge and insights on the issues at stake in the case of COB in Barbados. Special focus will be put on the possible risks and economies of scope which are generated by the multiple delivery of financial services. The above-mentioned research didn't observe significant effects of CMF on the financial performance or the portfolio quality of MFIs (H3). This paper will gather evidence on how savings or insurance services could influence the financial performance and portfolio quality of COB.

The third research questions deals with the point of view of the clients. An empirical research (Rossel-Cambier, 2010), involving 3500 complementary observations, reviews the effects of CMF on the social performance of MFIs. The study suggests positive effects of CMF on the breadth of outreach of MFIs (H4). This paper will explore if CMF has influenced the outreach of COB and will explore which were the factors leading to this. The same empirical study also suggests that the combination of credit with savings can lead to a relative decrease in the depth of poverty outreach, both viewed from gender- and income-related points of view (hypothesis H5 of this paper). This paper will gather deeper understanding on this issue by analysing the situation in COB. It will explore if there are any income or gender related barriers related to the participation in savings or insurance products.

4. What is the status of combined microfinance in Barbados?

Over the last three decennia, Barbados has graduated from a “developing” to a “highest developed” country status. It ranks number 37 in the human development index (UNDP, 2009) and is the highest of all independent countries in the world with an -in majority- Afro-descendant population. Despite its socio-economic achievements and relatively sound governance, the country still grapples with various forms of vulnerability and social exclusion.

While recent figures are not yet available (a poverty assessment is being undertaken during the preparation of this paper), most countries in the Eastern Caribbean sub-region face between 14 and 40% of absolute poverty (CDB, 2009). Young people, up to 24 years old, represent over 50% of the poor in all Eastern Caribbean countries (Rossel-Cambier, Olsen and Pourzand, 2007). Many citizens are working poor and are highly vulnerable - in case of external shocks such as natural disasters- to poverty (Bowen, 2007; Punnett *et al.*, 2006).

Barbados has different players in the traditional financial sector such as banks, insurance companies and the off-shore financial institutions (USAID, 2004). Private savings were estimated at 11.2% of GDP in 2006 (IMF, 2009). The insurance sector is an important

part of the financial system in Barbados. While informal savings and insurance systems, such as "sousous" still exist in certain communities, the formal insurance companies' penetration rate – the ratio of premiums to GDP- was equal to 10.3 percent in 2006, with 3.3 percent for life insurance and 7 percent for non-life insurance. This is the highest figure in the world with respect to non-life insurance and the 9th highest overall in total (IMF, 2009) and is reflected by the high level of competition between the various players.

Defining microcredit as the extension of very small loans (microloans) to the unemployed, poor entrepreneurs and other unbankable populations (Lapie, 2009), one can identify three types of microcredit providers in Barbados: NGOs, non-bank financial institutions (NBFI) and credit unions. These players offer combined microfinance at varying levels.

An example of an NGO providing microfinance is the Barbados Youth Business Trust. Set up in 1992, the organisation provides counselling and training to young people and offers business microloans and grants. The organisation, despite its small size, is engaged in combining various financial products. Since 1998, for the cost of about 3% of the loan value, it applies credit life insurance through the Insurance Corporation of Jamaica. The NGO also deducts from the loan reimbursements a mandatory pension contribution to the insurance company Clico on an individual pension plan.

{Insert table 1 here}

Examples of government supported non-bank financial institutions are the Barbados Agency for Micro Enterprise Development (FundAccess) and the Rural Development Commission. Also these have limited combinations between credit and insurance product delivery. Fundaccess, set up in 1998, provides to SMEs loan services combined with mandatory technical assistance. Since 2004, it also has a mandatory credit insurance covering invalidity, accident and life during the loan duration. This policy is subcontracted to the Sagicor insurance company. The Rural Development Commission runs a loan programme with concessionary loans to rural SMEs. There are no insurance or savings services linked to the loans, but proof of deposits or insurance policies by the client are considered as securities for loan approval.

In particular the cooperative sector is very active in combining multiple financial products. In fact the basis of their functioning is the linkage between credit and savings. Historically Barbados has an active cooperative sector, with over 35 unions serving today about 80% of its households. Much of its interventions are of "microfinance" nature as the cooperatives have a social objective, deal mainly with small monetary transactions and continue their historical aim to include unbankable clients. Credit unions, by definition, are organized by a group of people to save money and make loans to each other at favourable interest rates (Ryder, 2002). The sector remains highly concentrated with the two largest credit unions accounting for 71% of total assets. Credit union members usually have common interests such as their place of work, area of residence, professional organization or social group². Examples are the media, police, public workers or secondary teachers co-operative credit unions (see annex 3). Most of the credit unions offer loan and non-loan insurance products (e.g. funeral, accident, disability or health care) through established insurance companies.

One can summarise—in support of the hypothesis H1— that combined microfinance is actively practiced in Barbados, especially if one considers the credit unions as microfinance providers. The NBFIs and NGO managed schemes offer credit with low-intensity levels of insurance and little to no savings plans. The credit unions, on the contrary, are highly active in combining credit and savings. While direct delivery of insurance is forbidden by law, most of the unions offer indirectly different insurance products (middle to high intensity levels) through existing insurance companies which are well established on the island.

This case-study will focus on COB, one of the leading credit unions in Barbados. One can observe that some of the findings of this case study may not be extended to all types of microfinance providers in Barbados as they are different in nature. Knight and Hossein (2008) and Westley (2005) describe the NGO and government supported MFIs in Barbados as poor in marketing, financial performance and product diversification. The high level of subsidization would threaten the sustainability of the schemes (Wenner and Chalmers, 2001). The situation may be different in the case of credit unions, which have low direct subsidisation and better economic performance.

² See: <http://barbadoscoopleague.org/BCCULLI/> consulted on February 2010.

5. The City of Bridgetown Credit Union (COB) and combined microfinance

5.1. General overview

The City of Bridgetown is one of the leading credit unions in Barbados. The organisation has a historical focus on self employed clients and pro-poor financial services while in the same time achieving an impressive growth. Today it is the second largest credit of Barbados union, covering about 37% of cooperative clients, and combines various loan, savings and –to a limited extent- insurance products.

The C.O.B was registered in 1983. Historical documents indicate that the genesis of the credit union was a result of members having difficulty accessing funds from other financial institutions. These formed a society allowing young professionals and peers to channel their limited resources (COB, 2008). The objects of the COB refer to the combination of credit and savings and their affordability: *‘to create out of the savings of its members and otherwise, a source of credit available to its members on reasonable terms and conditions’*. In its mission statement, it refers to product diversity *‘delivering the most comprehensive and highest quality financial services that would attract membership’*.

Similar experiences to COB where credit unions have adopted more professional and business-like approaches can be found in other countries in the Caribbean and in Europe (Jones, 2008). Many transformed their traditional approaches to development based on small common bonds, volunteerism and informal collective action (Fuller *et al.*, 2006). Today, COB has over 47000 members, 104 employees working from two branches and its total operating expenses just over 6 million USD. Its total assets in 2010 were over 150 million USD, its total income 15.2 million USD. Its cost of funds is 3.48 million USD and its loan losses amounted at 1.876 million USD in the fiscal year 2009-2010. Many activities of the COB remain largely "micro" in nature due to the low average amounts of the financial transactions. This is strongly linked to the profile of the members of COB which are mainly from low and middle income groups. Sections 6 and

7 will give more analytical insights on the social and economic indicators of COB, as presented in table 2.

5.2. COB and combined microfinance

COB is involved in the delivery of both credit, savings and –to a limited extent- insurance products. Many of the transactions are "micro" of nature because of the average small amounts used (see infra). For each of these financial product groups, it has different approaches, activities and products.

In 2010, the COB serviced a wide array of loans to its members for a total amount of over 120 million USD. While over half of these funds are used for land and housing purposes, credit is also provided –in descending order- for vehicles, debt consolidation, personal purchases, business and investments. To be able to apply for a loan members must have a minimum of USD 75 in shares for a minimum period of thirty days. All members with loans in excess of their shares and deposits within the organization must save a minimum of USD 12.5 monthly. Since 2006, the COB has a specific loan policy (COB, 2006), which aims at ensuring that the member's savings and deposits are adequately protected, the Credit Union's investment in member loans are of high quality and that its return on investment is relative to the risk undertaken. The document reflects the diverse guidelines for its general policy, consumer loans, residential mortgage loans, its commercial loans and delinquency. The policy also refers to the conditions of the interest rates on loans which are determined by the Credit Union's Bye Laws. Interest rates on loans are linked to COB's prime lending rate with a risk premium being charged for the inherent risk in the loan transaction under consideration.

COB has a large savings portfolio reaching over 131 million USD in 2010. The management of COB expresses the importance of savings as follows:

"Savings lays at the heart of the growth strategy of COB"

The credit union offers different savings products which vary in time and level of interest return. It also provides targeted programmes such as the C.A.R.E.S.³ programme designed for children and young people from birth to 25 years. Developed in a 3-staged approach –juniors, teens and youth- it offers for each age group adapted savings incentives and scholarships. The reduced dependency on external financial products has shielded the COB partially from the international financial crisis. The credit union was not directly affected by the dropping shares of the financial products during the financial crisis of the years 2008-2010. Most managers and clients indicated that this aspect, linked with a strong savings base, has strengthened their confidence in the COB. Over the last two years, there has been a relative slower rate of savings accumulation. While savings increased yearly between 13.1 and 16.6% over the period 2005-2009, it only increased with a modest 5.8% and 3.65% in respectively 2009 in 2010. These results remain relatively positive compared with the country-wide deposits in the financial system. These decreased in Barbados from April 2008 to March 2009 with 3.24% from 4.430.278.000 USD to 4.286.651.500 USD (Central Bank of Barbados, online database⁴). Hence, COB, in comparison with other financial institutions, has in relative terms continued to expand its savings base despite the overall difficult economic environment.

Acknowledging that credit unions cannot offer insurance products by law, the COB is indirectly involved in the delivery of various insurance products for its clients. The COB has an internal "savings and loans" protection fund which could be considered as an internally managed credit and savings insurance scheme. The fund offers financial support in case of death of the lender or borrower. In collaboration with the Credit Union of the Public Workers and, it also indirectly enables its clients to enrol in the Guardian life insurance managed Co-op LIFE Advantage Plan designed to insure burial expenses for up to six family members. A similar product is the CoopMed Advantage plan, which includes a comprehensive package of primary and specialised health care services, at varying rates of reimbursement⁵. Different arrangements are available for individuals, small groups and large groups. While the COB doesn't internally manage these insurance programmes, it offers an office to the insurer facilitating easier access to its clients.

³ CARES stands for: Children Are Really Enthusiastic Savers

⁴ <http://data.centralbank.org.bb/>; accessed in October 2010

⁵ See: <http://www.coopmed.com/col/index.html>

6. Possible effects of CMF on the economic performance of the COB

As mentioned in section 2, an empirical survey in Latin America and the Caribbean found that CMF has stimulating effects on the efficiency and productivity of CMFs (H2) but didn't find any evidence on its effect on the financial performance or portfolio quality of MFIs (H3). This paper builds on primary and secondary data to better understand the possible contributions of CMF on economic performance. During the semi-structured interviews (see questionnaire 1), the MFI managers reported various relevant effects of CMF on the economic performance of their schemes.

6.1. Evidence on possible effects of CMF influencing the efficiency and productivity of the COB

As presented in table 2, the COB has a high ratio of members per staff of 455 in 2010 which indicates a relatively high level of productivity. The Operational Expense Ratio⁶ (OER) and the Operational Expenses per Loan (OEPL) values are relatively low, which also suggest that the COB is relatively efficient. This observation needs to be balanced as COB's cost per borrower –also a measure for efficiency- has increased from 96 USD in 2005 to 128.5 USD in 2010.

{Insert table 2 here}

The management of COB considers the delivery of credit, savings and insurance as: *"added value for the members and makes the functioning of the union more vibrant and relevant"*.

It may be difficult to attribute possible changes in the productivity and efficiency of the COB's to the delivery of multiple financial products. Still, the marketing value of CMF and the beneficial effects of deposits as source for loan delivery are economies of scope such which may positively influence the organisation's efficiency and productivity and hence support hypothesis H2.

⁶ The commonly agreed definitions of these variables are available in The Seep Network (2005).

6.1.1. Economies of scope: marketing

Product diversification is strongly linked with marketing, which can be defined as the process by which companies create customer interest in goods or services (Kotler *et al.*, 2008). The classic components of marketing are often organised by the "Four Ps": product, price, place, and promotion (Cannon, Perreault and McCarthy, 2009). This approach allows one to review how CMF can contribute to the marketing of MFIs.

Both managers and clients report that the combination of credit and savings has played a stimulating role in the popularity of the lending instruments (*product*). The ratio-based lending approach, often also referred as the "1-3 principle", allows that for every dollar saved, you are allowed to borrow three dollars without need for collateral. This practice, often extended up to "1-8" for specific loans (f.e. housing), is recognised by most respondents as an important marketing tool. The COB has through this lending approach been able to attract many low and middle income customers. Since 2004, in order to attract higher loans, the COB also applies the risk-based lending approach, which looks into the risk profile of the loan taker.

Both the COB corporate and the Government public policies influence the *price* of CMF. Recognizing the possible financial barriers participating in the credit union, the COB aims at keeping the costs of the transactions linked to deposits as low as possible at the expense of other financial transactions. In this way, the organisation aims at broadening its client and savings base. In the meantime, to encourage clients to save with credit unions, the government allows personal tax reductions for savings with credit unions. Until 2010, credit union members could claim up to 6500 USD per year in tax-allowances in addition to 5000 USD in contribution to a registered retirement savings plan.

We can also observe the stimulating role of CMF on the existing distribution channels (*place*). While persons visit the union to make deposits at the COB premises for example, they can receive information about the various other lending and insurance products. As insurance delivery by credit unions is not allowed by law in Barbados, an external insurance company, Guardian life, has a counter with an external counter clerk in the

COB office premises. This allows both organisations to mutually benefit from direct contact with the visiting clients.

Marketing is also linked with all aspects of generating or enhancing product demand, including advertising (*promotion*). Often in promotional messages, the concrete role of CMF is explained highlighting the articulations between the various financial products. In one of the promotion brochures, one can find:

“When you borrow from a credit union, your savings remain intact so that while you pay your loan, your savings continue to grow”.

Many interviewed clients indicated that they are more attracted to unions offering a wider choice of products. Hence the very nature of product diversification can have a promotional value.

In summary, the COB experience shows that financial product diversification can lead to economies of scope for marketing in various areas. As the number of promoted financial products increases, more people can be reached per dollar spent. This can be achieved by means of product design, distributional, promotional or price-related synergies.

6.1.2. Economies of scope: deposits as cost-efficient sources for loan delivery

Economies of scope can be achieved by the advantageous use of low-cost deposits for loan delivery. The element of savings allows the COB to offer more efficiently competitive interest rates on loans, as the main sources of funding are share capital and deposits. The interest rate of deposits is lower than the lending rate of external capital as indicated in table 3.

{Insert table 3 here}

When analysing the net interest income sources, the interest cost on member’s savings (ranging between 2.5% and 4%; the latter being the dividend rate paid on the cooperative shares) is much lower in comparison with the interest paid on external loans. The COB has two external loan agreements with the National Insurance Board totalling an amount of 12.5 million USD at a minimum rate of 5.5% per annum.

The continued growth of the savings base has allowed the COB to significantly expand its loan portfolio. Between 2005 and 2010, the amount of savings has grown from 80,28 to 131.979 million USD (COB, 2010). While relying on a limited amount of external borrowings, the COB has almost doubled its loan portfolio from 61.66 million USD in 2005 to 122.373 million USD in 2010. This observation can be generalised for Barbados at large. Between 1980 and 2009, the total assets of credit unions in Barbados have grown from less than 5 million USD to 635 million USD. In 2009, the total of the deposits of the credit unions is estimated at 346 million USD and the amount of loans totalled over 491 million USD (BCCULL, 2009). Hence, at the national level, the increase of deposits has allowed the credit unions to grow in Barbados.

Despite its advantages for loan delivery, the use of savings may increase the liquidity risk of the organisation. Relying on this source of funds, the COB is exposed to daily calls on its available cash resources from the savings and deposits resources as well as the possible withdrawal of shares. Therefore, a combination of external and internal resources for loan delivery may counterbalance to a limited extent this risk and avoid undue concentration.

6.2. What are the possible effects of CMF on other elements of economic performance? (H3)

The economic performance of MFIs can be -beyond efficiency and productivity elements- considered from various other angles such as the financial performance and the portfolio quality (The SEEP Network, 2005). Financial performance, referring to elements of profitability and sustainability, can be measured by indicators such as the return on assets (ROA), return on equity (ROE) and the operational self sufficiency (OSS)⁷. Portfolio quality is more associated with the risk elements of the portfolio and relates to indicators such as the portfolio at risk at 30 days (PAR30) and the risk coverage ratio (RCR). Empirical research –see hypothesis H3- didn't find any significant effects of CMF on these other economic performance elements. Observations in this case-study underline the difficulty to attribute elements of CMF to these specific areas.

⁷ For definitions of the various financial indicators: see the SEEP Network (2005).

6.2.1. Financial Performance

In general terms, as reflected in table 2, the COB has realised a relative sound financial performance during the period 2005-2010. The constant positive values for return on assets (ROA) indicate profitability. The gradually decreased but still positive Return on Equity (ROE) values indicate that the credit union continues to build equity through retained earnings. Increased equity enables the MFI to leverage more financing and can be considered as an element of sustainability. The Operational Self Sufficiency, which has been above break-even over the period 2005-2010 is gradually decreasing. This means that the COB over time is less able to cover its costs through operating revenues and needs to improve the costing structure of its loan delivery portfolio.

The leading question is: How can CMF influence financial performance in this context? Certainly, the low cost aspects of savings funds for loan delivery can be an element which could drive down the costs and hence increase RoA, RoE and OSS. Still, the management of deposits involves also transaction costs –higher than managing an external loan- which may reduce the difference in overall costs between both financing sources. In the current case study there is no disaggregated data available to enter more in detail on this issue.

The effects of the two existing insurance elements -credit insurance and health/accident insurance- on the overall financial performance picture may also be limited. The Savings and Loans benefit fund, acts as a low-intensity insurance offering cash benefit in case of decease of a member. It has disbursed 84250.5 USD and 140506 USD in respectively 2010 and 2009. Still, these figures remain relatively marginal towards the total operating expenses (respectively 1.4% and 2.3%) and the overall loan portfolio (respectively 0.069% and 0.119%). Because of its financial risks, the credit union is considering replacing the Savings and Loans benefit fund by an external mutual benefits plan, offered by the Barbados Co-operative and Credit Union League (BCCULL) Co-operators General Insurance Company. The latter also offers life savings, loan protection and funeral insurance on comparable conditions (BCCULL and CGIC, 2009)⁸. To participate

⁸ The life savings product combines savings and insurance in the way that it insures members against loss of life or loss of limb or sight in case of accident. The loan protection product combines credit and insurance as it provides reimbursement of outstanding loans in case of death, disability or temporary

in this plan, on a monthly basis, the respective credit unions need to pay a premium to the plan which is 0.038% for savings side and 0.030% for loans. As projected by the estimated calculations presented in the annex 5, outsourcing to this option may be more expensive than maintaining the internally managed loan and savings protection fund.

The participation of clients in the Co-op LIFE CoopMed Advantage plans, which are of high intensity insurance nature, could have an indirect positive effect on the costs related to decreased loan losses. Still, as these voluntary schemes have a low penetration rate in the overall membership of the COB (an estimated of 2% of all clients is enrolled in one of these schemes), the effect on the overall financial performance may be limited.

6.2.2. Portfolio quality

The increased level of loan delinquency is one of the main challenges of the COB and affects its portfolio quality. The value of all loans outstanding that have one or more instalments of principal past due more than 90 days has increased from 5.0% in 2005 to 7.0% in 2010 and can –following the management of the COB- be estimated at three times higher when expressed at 30 days. With a Risk Coverage Ratio from 89.5% in 2005 and 68.3% in 2010, the portfolio at risk coverage by the loan-loss allowance has decreased over years. In practice this means that the COB is less prepared to absorb loan losses in the worst case scenario. The increased expenses are linked with the increased allocation for loan-loss provisions (increase in provision for impaired loans from 500.000 USD in 2009 to 1.876.500 USD in 2010) which is a response to the declining loan quality.

In this context, can the presence of savings or insurance influence the high level of loan delinquency? From a general point of view one can observe that the effect of the life savings and loan insurance fund is only having a small effect on the portfolio quality. In the case of COB, this form of insurance only deals with non-payment of loans (or compensation for savings) in case of deceasing members, which is only a small portion of the all cases of loan delinquency. The decrease in the spending of the Savings and Loans

disability. The funeral grants scheme is a combined savings-insurance scheme. It assists families of the deceased member by matching the amount of the savings up to an amount of 1500 USD, and can vary depending of the age of the member.

benefit fund and the sharp increase in the provision for impaired loans between 2009 and 2010 has made its relative financial volume less significant. The ratio between the first and the latter has decreased from 28.10% in 2009 to 4.49% in 2010. With the 2010 figures, it is difficult to expect that the presence of the Savings and Loans benefit fund has a high significant effect on the current portfolio at risk.

Generally, one can imagine that the presence of savings mitigates the risk for non-reimbursement of loans. The COB set conditions for loan-taking linked to savings products. Clients need to have a minimum of USD 75 in shares for a minimum period of thirty days and –if one has a volume of loans larger than the sum of their shares and deposits- the need to save a minimum of USD 12.5 monthly may have little effect on the loan delinquency. Still, beyond side effects of continued savings, the financial volume of these saving conditions remains relatively small towards the average loan per member was 2788 USD in 2010. Moreover, the evolution from ratio-based to risk-based lending has decreased the linkages between savings and loans.

7. Understanding the possible effects of CMF on the social performance of the COB

7.1. Do savings or insurance products contribute to the breadth of poverty outreach of the COB?

Outreach can be appreciated in a number of ways. The most generally accepted indicator for the breadth of outreach of microcredit organizations is the number of active borrowers (Copestake, 2007). The available data suggests that the COB has a wide breadth of outreach in Barbados. As reflected in table 2, the COB has the second largest client base of all credit unions in Barbados, with a growth from 38620 in 2005 to 47337 members in 2010.

Barbadian credit unions –in general- have been very effective in achieving breadth of poverty outreach. The island’s credit unions have been growing in size from 10.000 three decennia ago to reaching over 130.000 members (BCCULL, 2009). Hence, with a total population of 270.000 people, the unions may have almost universal coverage of the low

and middle income Barbadian households. The sector remains highly concentrated with the two largest credit unions accounting for 73% of the total membership. 19 credit unions have fewer than 600 members, while two have over 45,000 members. Interviewees observe that many smaller credit unions, involving often an ageing volunteer base, have been forced to close or integrate in the larger schemes. One of reported reasons for this would be following a cooperative union promoter:

"the less attractive product range offered to the clients."

Hence, product diversification can be considered as an element to attract new customers, especially in the competitive environment amongst the various credit unions in Barbados. Many other non-financial elements may also play an important role in this growing outreach. The COB has only two physical branches, but has concluded an agreement with the national CARIFS Network allowing their members to access their accounts through 100 ATMs and 5000 points of sale in the island. It also has an agreement with the Barbados National Bank allowing its members to use its branches for selected transactions.

It is notable to observe that the COB –and the cooperative sector at large- has achieved a larger client base than the non-cooperative microfinance providers. Knight and Hossein (2008) suggest that there is inadequate outreach to SMEs by the NGO and government supported MFIs. As presented in table 1, one can observe that the breadth of outreach of the NGO and NBFIs remains relatively low, with the average number of new loans per organisation not exceeding 100 per year. While it is difficult to attribute this observation to the lower intensity of financial product diversification, it may seem logical that clients are attracted by organisations which allow them to save and borrow (and to a limited extent insure) simultaneously. Various sources in literature (Lee and Sawada, 2010; Christen *et al.*, 2004) underscore that savings is the most demanded financial service of low-income groups.

The COB –together with the Barbados Public Workers' Co-operative Credit Union- promotes the advanced CoopMed Advantage life and health insurance plan (see *infra*) which –with 2000 enrolments- remains relatively modest in outreach (BCCULL, 2009). Affordability, relevance, interest and knowledge are the main reasons why clients report not to participate in the insurance plans. Most interviewed clients recognise the

advantages of the health insurance plan such as higher quality private health services, but consider it as an unnecessary cost as public health care is free of cost in Barbados.

In summary, the case of the COB is in line with the hypothesis H4, suggesting that product diversification has a stimulating effect on the breadth of outreach of MFIs.

7.2. Can financial product diversification influence the depth of poverty outreach of the COB?

7.2.1. Possible effects of CMF on income-related depth of poverty outreach

The management of the COB estimates that:

"80% of COB clients earn less than 1000 USD per month and could be considered as low income, taking into account the high costs of living for households in Barbados."

The financial access to membership of the COB is adapted to low income groups. The credit union managers claim that their products are pro-poor because the enrolment costs are minimal: new members are requested to pay an average of 25 USD in stakes as well as a small fee. The main costs are included in the interest rate linked to the loans which makes that almost no costs are charged for the basic savings services.

Proxies for the income-related depth of outreach are the averages size of the loan or savings divided by the GNI per capita of Barbados. As presented in table 2, one can observe that the level of average savings or loans⁹ per GNI per capita remains around 20%. Despite the proposed maximum amount of 300.000 USD per loan, this figure supports the relative low-income level of the target group of the COB. When comparing with other MFIs in Barbados (table 1), one can observe ALBpGNI values ranging from 3% to 2463%. A particular case is the MFI FundAccess which has a relatively large average loan/GNI per capita of 131%. This may be linked with the specific nature of this organisation which focuses on small business support loan delivery which may entail larger loan levels. In summary, one can suggest that the COB has a majority of low and middle income families and offers the opportunity for high income persons to join the scheme.

⁹ In case of loans, this indicator is calculated as: total amount of loans/total number of clients. The average level of loans is expected to be double as high.

Our third research question is: Does the combined character of the financial product portfolio influence the outreach of the COB to the poor? Most interviewed clients underscore the relevance of the various financial products for their business and private development. Still, one can observe that various side-effects of the savings and insurance product delivery can lead to relative disadvantages for the poor and vulnerable clients.

One can observe that the COB's interest rates –indicators of the affordability of lending– vary between different kinds of loans, ranging between 6.5 and 16%. The union offers lower interest rates for loans which are secured. In certain cases for example, the availability of proof of insurance on goods or assets is considered as a plus (collateral) for loan approval. The cooperative also offers a combined loan-savings product which has a reduced interest rate of 7.25%. Hence, loans are more affordable for clients in case of CMF. Still, one can observe that increasing savings or purchasing insurance products requires financial means, which often only higher income groups can afford. Hence, product diversification can have the unfortunate effect where higher income groups have easier financial access to CMF and hence also to lower interest loans. Low income groups on the other hand, may have difficulty affording insurance or engaging fully in savings, and may –in these conditions– ultimately be charged higher interest rates when lending.

CMF characteristics of the COB can lead to other exclusionary effects. One example is the shift of ratio based lending towards risk based lending. The ratio-based lending approach links the maximum amount of the loan with the current availability of deposits of the loan taker (see supra). In this case mostly no other collateral is required. The risk-based lending approach looks into the risk profile of the loan taker and can hence allow higher loan levels if the defined conditions are met, often involving collateral. The latter approach may implicitly entail an exclusionary effect, by setting stringent conditions often incompatible with lower-income or vulnerable population groups.

The conditions of the insurance policies also have conditions which can lead to social exclusion. The CoopMED advantage plan for example doesn't cover persons over 65 years in the general plan and has a mandatory medical examination for members of over 40 years of age. Similarly, the CoopLife limits access to credit union members younger

than 75 years. These conditions can be considered as exclusionary elements as they limit the plan's access in function of the risk profile of the client.

7.2.2. Is the gender related depth of outreach of the COB influenced by the financial product diversification?

From a gender perspective, in the past, women, especially older females, were not considered as good business risks for loan delivery, as men were seen as more secure financially (Morgan, 2010). Being 'unbankable', many of these females pooled their monies in 'meeting turn' groups or 'sousous'. These societies became formalised as savings societies over the years and connected workers of a specific plantation, business, or members of a church, service or charitable organisation. A promoter of the cooperative movement in Barbados suggests that:

"cooperatives have in an environment of many women-headed households, enabled many women of low and middle income earning to achieve greater financial security and consequently improve their lives, gain knowledge and self-esteem".

COB reaches out to low- and middle income groups and is reaching men and women equally. The clientele of the COB reflects the gender distribution in society, with 45% male and 55% female clients. There are no reported difficulties for either gender to participate in the various financial schemes. The management reports a tendency for larger loans (housing) by female clients, while the smaller credits (business development, vehicles or equipment) have a more gender balanced clientele. The management of the COB indicates that the participation in savings is equal between men and women. With relation to the CO-OP LIFE Advantage plan (Guardian Life), the use of funeral insurance (covering up to 6 persons) has a large majority of female clients (about 90%) as is the case with health insurance (about 70%). No gender disaggregated data is available on savings in the COB.

When reviewing microfinance and poverty in the Caribbean, Lashley (2004) observes insufficient targeting of the undereducated, young, rural and female. The findings of this paper support these statements partially. COB, in line with its social mission, aims at enhancing social inclusion through a number of social funds, and programmes for the

social targeting of vulnerable groups. As these funds build on pooled resources and deal with social risks, their nature is strongly related to microinsurance interventions.

The Membership Assistance Fund for example, financed with predefined deductions from the surplus, deals with members who are deemed to be in a weak financial position. Annually, the equivalent of the lower of 2.5 USD per member or 2.5% of the surplus from operations is allocated to this fund. During the year ended on March 31, 2010, an amount of 54.753 USD was utilised under this fund. The COB Cares fund is a savings programme that provides the possibility to receive education scholarships for young people under 25 years of age. In the period 2009-2010, it disbursed 56.786 USD.

The Common Good Fund, allows the C.O.B to engage in community and social responsibility work. 29825 USD was spent in the period March 2009-2010. The credit union has targeted interventions to the small business owners, which have the highest delinquency rates taking business loans. Until 2009 for example, the COB was running a “Green Light Project”, which offered free of cost expert services to the small business members.

These efforts are commendable, as they prove the social commitment of the COB and – each fund differently- have specific pro-poor objectives. Still, to be more meaningful, these funds could be even be more targeted, with clear criteria, which ensure that the most needy are being reached in the most objective way. This would allow the COB to more proactively tackle gender or age sensitive vulnerable groups. Possible interventions could focus on the specific support needs of marginalised young males, the challenges of single-headed households or the vulnerability of adolescent mothers (Parks and Rossel-Cambier, 2008). Alternatively, COB could also facilitate low cost insurance or develop savings accumulation programmes for the low-income groups.

In summary, this case-study finds limited evidence that the gender-related depth of poverty outreach is influenced by the presence of CMF. There is a tendency for greater use of voluntary insurance by female clients, but the marginal overall use of the insurance doesn't allow one to link this practice with any the current gender-sensitive depth of outreach of COB. In this context, our findings cannot comfortably support or contradict the hypothesis 5 from a gender-specific perspective. This may be linked with a reality in

Barbados where both males and females are vulnerable to poverty. While females can be exposed in their role as single-headed households or teenage mothers, many males are affected by low levels of education linked with social marginalisation.

8. Conclusions and recommendations

This paper aims at generating greater understanding of the possible effects of CMF on the social and economic performance of MFIs. It highlights the presence and characteristics of combined microfinance in Barbados. Referring to a stakeholders research framework (Rossel-Cambier, 2008), it gathers knowledge including qualitative information from one of its leading credit unions, the City of Bridgetown.

The case study finds that the majority of MFIs in Barbados actively apply CMF. In particular the cooperative sector is most active in providing both credit, savings and –to a limited extent- insurance services. These findings are in line with available empirical research (Rossel-Cambier, 2009).

Gathering knowledge from the economic performance of COB, the case study suggests that CMF allows a number of economies of scope which may enhance both efficiency and productivity outcomes. In the marketing field, one can observe stimulating effects on its design, price, distribution and promotion outcomes. The low-cost use of deposits for lending purposes can also enhance the cost-efficiency of its operations. The case study underlines the difficulty to attribute elements of CMF to the financial performance or the portfolio quality of COB. The case-study also suggests that savings services have transaction cost elements which can reduce profitability. The possible effects of insurance and savings on the portfolio quality (loan delinquency), remain relatively marginal and difficult to measure in the case of COB. These findings are in support of a regional empirical survey on the issue (Rossel-Cambier, 2010a and 2010b), but offer deeper insights on the dynamics behind the economic indicators.

COB –as the cooperative sector at large in Barbados- has been most instrumental in achieving a large breadth of outreach. The presence of multiple financial products,

especially savings, are reported to contribute to these achievements. COB serves mainly low and middle income population groups. Still, the combined nature of services does not automatically enhance greater inclusion of low-income groups. The additional financial requirements to participate in savings or insurance can be obstacles to full participation of vulnerable groups. Analysing dynamics with loan delivery, the non-participation in savings or insurance can even lead to even greater barriers of access to the loan products such as higher interest rates. While information on savings isn't available, in particular female clients actively participate in the voluntary insurance schemes. This underscores their relevance from a women development point of view. The COB has set up a number of funds to support selected social outcomes. While the funds have a specific mission, they could benefit from greater gender-sensitive targeting involving transparent selection criteria.

The findings from this case study offer more insights on the process dynamics how a cooperative union and its clients are influenced by multiple financial products. The gathered in-depth knowledge gives one the opportunity to make a number of observations and suggestions.

The case-study highlights the dynamics of tension between commercialisation and poverty outreach, and various design elements of CMF play an important role in this trade off. COB has changed its loan policy from a ratio-based approach to a risk-based approach. This has allowed the organisation to expand its loan portfolio and also reach out to higher income groups. The participation of high income groups should contribute to a reduction of the current high loan delinquency and offer efficiency advantages. Still, to reach out to unbankable populations, it should proactively encourage access to its product range to low-income groups. The existing internal social funds can contribute to serve these purposes, but could even be stronger designed to reach the most vulnerable. Commercialisation and poverty outreach may not be mutually exclusive but can support each other. The design of risk-pooling arrangement could enable cross-subsidization, a process where selected benefits can be transferred from the high to the low income groups.

The depth of poverty outreach remains a most controversial issue. While insurance and savings have a natural social function in safeguarding or securing ones assets, various

barriers –such as affordability and information asymmetry- keep full participation away from the lower income groups. Future research could look deeper into the various ways these barriers could be limited.

The marketing role of CMF may bridge economic and social outcomes of MFIs. CMF enhances marketing, which one can define as *'the process by which companies create customer interest in goods or services'* (Kotler *et al.*, 2008). This increased customer interest should stimulate the breadth of outreach, which is a social performance outcome.

While analysing the experience of Barbados, one has to take into account the role of macroeconomic features. Ahlin, Lin and Maio (2010) argue that the economic performance of MFIs is influenced by a number of macro-economic factors such as national economic growth. Hence, in case of low-income countries with weak public governance, some of the lessons learned in Barbados may not apply.

Barbados has achieved significant levels of human development, and many stakeholders are convinced that combined microfinance –with the cooperative unions covering the large majority of households- has significantly contributed to this. For MFIs, beyond the different risks, may benefit economically and in outreach when offering simultaneously loans, savings or insurance. Still, to be in line with the organisation's mission, it is of most importance to undertake all possible efforts to enhance full participation of vulnerable and unbankable clients in the most relevant savings and insurance schemes.

Table 1. Selected social performance indicators of Barbadian microfinance providers

Organisation	Number of borrowers	Range of Loan size /GNI per capita	Number of female / male borrowers	Type of services	Interest rate (annual rate)	Target group
Fundaccess	844 clients with 971 loans between 1998 and April 2010	Between 3% and 411% with an average of 131%	NA	Credit and credit insurance	6% (5% subsidy government)	Micro business sector
Youth Business trust	364 between 1994 and June 2009	Between 4% and 124% with average of 26.7%	49%	Credit, credit insurance and mandatory pension contribution	10-12%	Those aged between 18 and 35. Physically challenged applicants are encouraged
Rural Development Commission	550 since start	Up to 206% with an average of 33.6%	NA	Credit – existing insurance policies are taken into account for loan approval	4-6%	Rural micro enterprises with fixed and moveable assets less than 200,000.00 USD involved in start-up and/or existing agricultural, fishing and other small businesses
Various Credit unions	Over 130.000 members with individual unions between 600 and 48000 active members	NA	NA	Savings, credit and mostly credit insurance (external); some offer life, funeral and health insurance (external)	NA	Low and middle income groups, often brought together under occupational or area-based coherence.
COB	47337	Up to 2053% with average of 18.06%	55%	Credit, Savings, life credit insurance (internal), life, funeral and health insurance (external)	6.5 to 16%	Low and middle income groups, initially because of their unbankable situation, but now open to a large public

Table 2. Performance indicators of the COB for the period 2005-2010

Economic performance indicators	2010	2009	2008	2007	2006	2005
Return on Assets (RoA)	2.48%	1.67%	2.16%	2.13%	7.51%	1.65%
Return on Equity (RoE)	23.89%	17.64%	22.05%	25.45%	76.91%	19.04%
Operational Self Sufficiency (OpSS)	101.77%	114.71%	125.85%	126.49%	128.99%	130.70%
Operational Expense Ratio (OER)	3.97%	4.30%	3.80%	4.10%	4.30%	4.60%
Operational Expenses per Loan (OEPL)	4.96%	4.89%	4.50%	4.92%	5.29%	6.01%
Cost per Borrower – CPB (USD)	128	128.50	108.00	109.00	103.50	96.00
Members/staff	455.16	472.08	466.05	478.27	442.25	454.35
Portfolio at Risk – PAR (90 d)	7.00%	6.90%	5.10%	4.60%	4.80%	5.00%
Risk Coverage Ratio (+12 months)	68.3%	44.40%	48.00%	85.70%	85.20%	89.50%
Social performance indicators						
Number of clients	47337	46738	46139	44001	40687	38620
Average loan per member /GNI per capita	18.06%	17.55%	17.39%	18.56%	17.92%	16.15%
Average savings per member/GNI per capita	19.08%	18.64%	19.48%	19.86%	20.09%	20.47%
Female clients	55%	55%	55%	55%	55%	55%

Table 3. COB Interest Rate Variances

Financial product	Value/Range in 2010	Value/Range in 2009
Cash	2.50%	3.00%
Members savings	2.50-4.00%	3.25-5.25%
Loans to members	9.00%-16.50%	9.00%-16.50%
Loan payable	5.50%	5.50%
Investments	3.00-4.00%	4.25-5.25%

Annex 1. Guiding Questionnaire for Financial institutions

Questionnaire Number:

Contact:	
Date:	
Name organisation:	
I. <u>General information</u>	
1. Type organisation: NGO / Bank / cooperative / NBFi / other	
2. When has the organisation set up?	
3. Which financial products does the organisation offer?	
Financial product	Which services? Since when?
Loan products	
-	
-	
-	
Savings products	
-	
-	
-	
Insurance products	
-	
-	
-	
Other services	
-	
-	

4. Give following indicators:

Indicator/year	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Return on Assets (RoA)					
Return on Equity (RoE)					
Operational Self Sufficiency (OpSS)					
Operational Expense Ratio					
Operational expenses / loan portfolio					
Number of borrowers/staff					

Number of savers/staff					
Portfolio at risk 30 days					
Risk coverage ratio					
Number of clients					
% of female borrowers					
Av Loan Balance per B/GNI per Capita					

II. CMF delivery

<p>1. Who is your target group?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do you aim at including poor persons in your financial scheme? • If yes, what is the percentage of poor clients ? 	
<p>2. Do you undertake specific actions to reach to the poor? If yes, which?</p>	
<p>3. Do you have specific actions towards males or females? If yes, which?</p>	
<p>4. Why do you (or not) offer savings products?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does it make a difference for the clients? • Does it make a difference for the institution? • Give examples 	
<p>5. Why do you (or not) offer insurance products?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does it make a difference for the clients? • Does it make a difference for the institution? • Give examples 	

III. In case of CMF delivery

<p>1. Does the combined delivery of credit and insurance impact the functioning of your organisation? How?</p>	
<p>2. Does the combined delivery of credit and savings impact the functioning of your organisation? How?</p>	

Annex 2. Guiding Questionnaire for Clients

Questionnaire Number:

<p>Client of which financial institution: Sex: Date:</p>	
<p>1. How long are you member of the financial institution?</p>	
<p>2. Why did you choose for this financial institution?</p>	
<p>3. Which products do you use?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Loan products: • Savings products: • Insurance products: • Other: 	
<p>4. Do you have any difficulties accessing specific services? If yes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Which services? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Loan products: ○ Savings products: ○ Insurance products: ○ Other: • How? • Does your financial institution make special efforts to accommodate access to its services? • Is the situation the same for males and females? 	
<p>5. Does your financial organisation gender specific approach? If yes, how? If not, how should this look like?</p>	
<p>6. Does your financial organisation have a pro-poor approach? If yes, how? If not, how should this look like?</p>	

Annex 3. List of credit unions member of the Barbados Co-operative and Credit Union League

1. Barbados Media Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
2. Barbados Police Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
3. Barbados Public Workers' Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
4. Barbados Secondary Teachers' Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
5. Barbados Seventh-day Adventist Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
6. Barbados Shipping & Trading Employees' Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
7. Barbados Teachers' Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
8. Barbados Workers' Union Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
9. Bartel Credit Union Ltd.
10. BET Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
11. Bethel Circuit Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
12. Bottlers United Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
13. Caribank Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
14. Church of God Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
15. Church of the Nazarene Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
16. City of Bridgetown Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
17. Courtesy Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
18. Endeavour Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
19. Family Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
20. Goodwill Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
21. Hinds Transport Services Co-operative Credit Union League
22. James Street Circuit Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
23. Light & Power Employees' Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
24. Moravian Church Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
25. Progressive Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
26. Prudential Co-operative Credit Union
27. Public Transport Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
28. Shamrock Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
29. St. Barnabas Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
30. St. Leonard's Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
31. St. Mark's Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
32. St. Stephen's Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
33. United Enterprise Credit Union Ltd.
34. University of the West Indies (Cave Hill) Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.
35. Wesleyan Holiness Co-operative Credit Union Ltd.

Annex 4. Persons interviewed

- Sasha Grant, Barbados Public Workers Credit Union
- Anthony Pilgrim, General Manager, Barbados Co-operative and Credit Union League Ltd
- Anthony Johnson, Project Leader, Barbados Co-operative and Credit Union League Ltd
- Marcia Brandon, Director, Barbados Youth Business Trust
- Hamilton Roach, General Manager, Fundaccess
- Esther Lord Graham, Loan Manager, Fundaccess
- Angela Patrick, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines Cooperative Credit Union
- Sasha Grant, Barbados Public Workers Union
- Algie Yearwood, City of Bridgetown Co-operative Credit Union
- Glendon S.Bell, CEO, City of Bridgetown Co-operative Credit Union
- Wendy Springer, Branch Manager, City of Bridgetown Co-operative Credit Union
- Jessie Brooker, Officer, Guardian life
- Karlene Gordon, Programme Financial Specialist - BYBT/Accountant - IADB MIF Mentorship Enhancement Project, Barbados Youth Business Trust
- Jeffrey Cox, Director Barbados Rural Development Commission
- Alister Fleming, Loan officer, Barbados Rural Development Commission
- Leisa Peirch, Programme manager, UNDP Office for Barbados and the OECS
- Regis Lowe, Cooperative officer, Registrar of Cooperative Societies
- Clients and non-clients of credit unions
- Peter Blackman, Caribbean Development Bank
- Travis Mitchell, former research officer, Barbados Central Bank

Annex 5. Projected comparison of costs between outsourced and internally managed savings and loan protection insurance

Context:

The savings and loans benefit fund has disbursed 84250.5 USD and 140506 USD in respectively 2010 and 2009. COB could consider replacing this internal fund by an external plan, such as the life savings, loan protection and funeral grants plan of BCCULL and CGIC. To participate in this plan, on a monthly basis, credit unions need to pay a premium to the plan which is 0.38‰ on the savings side and 0.30‰ on the loan side. This annex reviews whether outsourcing this life insurance function would be beneficial for the COB.

From a simplified perspective, if the COB had constant savings and loans during 2010, it would have to pay the following amounts to insure its savings and loan portfolio through the external life insurance policy:

$$\tau \times 12 \times \varphi = \rho \quad (1)$$

In this simplified equation (1) one can find:

τ = Insurance rate expressed in %

φ = Financial volume to be insured (savings or loans) expressed in USD

ρ = Yearly insurance cost expressed in USD

Situation 2010:

- Savings: $0.038\% \times 12 \times 131.979.000 \text{ USD} = 601824 \text{ USD}$;
- Loans: $0.030\% \times 12 \times 122.373.000 \text{ USD} = 440543 \text{ USD}$

The total cost for insuring both loans and savings would hence be: 1.042.367 USD. This amount is over ten times higher than the amount of 84250.5 USD which was paid for the fund in 2010.

Situation 2009:

- Savings: $0.038\% \times 12 \times 127.330.000 \text{ USD} = 580624 \text{ USD}$;
- Loans: $0.030\% \times 12 \times 118.120.000 \text{ USD} = 425232 \text{ USD}$

In 2009, the total cost for insuring both loans and savings would be 1.005.856USD, which is also still much higher than the 140506 USD which the COB paid for its internal fund in the same year¹⁰.

¹⁰ One has to recognise that the benefits are different between the schemes and that hence a more detailed comparison could be made – this is not the purpose of this paper.

References

AHLIN, C., LIN, J and MAIO M., (2010), Where Does Microfinance Flourish? Microfinance Institution Performance in Macroeconomic Context, *Journal of Development Economics*, 51 pages.

BARBADOS CO-OPERATIVE AND CREDIT UNION LEAGUE LTD. (BCCULL), (2009), Annual Report 2009, 62 pages.

BARBADOS CO-OPERATIVE AND CREDIT UNION LEAGUE LTD AND THE CO-OPERATORS GENERAL INSURANCE COMPANY LIMITED, (2009), The Mutual Benefits Plan. All you need to know, 6 pages.

BOWEN, G., (2007) The Challenges of Poverty and Social Welfare in the Caribbean, *International Journal of Social Welfare*, pages 150-158.

CANNON J.P., PERREAULT W. and MCCARTHY E., (2009), Essentials of Marketing. A planning strategy approach, McGraw Hill Higher Education; 12th revised edition, 608 pages.

CARIBBEAN DEVELOPMENT BANK, (2009), St. Kitts and Nevis - CPA 2007/2008, St. Kitts and Nevis - Country Poverty Assessment 2007/2008: Volume I - Living Conditions in St. Kitts and Nevis, 139 pages.

CARIBBEAN DEVELOPMENT BANK, (2009), Antigua and Barbuda - CPA 2007 Volume 1, Antigua and Barbuda - Country Poverty Assessment Report August 2007: Volume I - Main Report, 289 pages.

CITY OF BRIDGETOWN CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT UNION LIMITED (COB), (2010), Annual Report 2009-2010, 64 pages.

CITY OF BRIDGETOWN CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT UNION LIMITED (COB), (2009), Annual Report 2008-2009, 72 pages.

CITY OF BRIDGETOWN CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT UNION LIMITED, (2008), Amended By-Laws, 17 pages.

CITY OF BRIDGETOWN CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT UNION LIMITED, (2006), Loan Policy, 43 pages.

COPESTAKE J. (2007), Mainstreaming Microfinance: Social Performance Management or Mission Drift?, Elsevier, *World Development* Vol. 35, No 10, pages 1721-1738.

CHRISTEN R.P., ROSENBERG R. and JAYADEVA V., (2004), Financial Institutions with a Double Bottom Line: Implications for the Future of Microfinance, CGAP Occasional paper No 8, available at: <http://www.cgap.org/p/site/c/template.rc/1.9.2701/>, 20 pages

GOVERNMENT OF BARBADOS, (2007), Co-operative Societies Act, No 2006-29, 136 pages.

FULLER, D., MELLOR, M., DODDS, L., AFFLECK, A., (2006), Consulting the community: advancing financial inclusion in Newcastle upon Tyne, UK, *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 26 (5–6), pages 255–271.

HOSSAIN F., KNIGHT T. AND ARUN T., (2009), Financing Low-Income Borrowers in the Caribbean: Experiences from the Barbadian Microfinance Sector, *Asian Journal of Latin American Studies* Vol 22, pages 41-68.

JONES P.A., (2008), From tackling poverty to achieving financial inclusion—The changing role of British credit unions in low income communities, *Journal of Socio-Economics*, Volume 37, Issue 6, pages 2141-2154.

IMF, (2009), Barbados: Financial System Stability Assessment—Update, including Reports on the Observance of Standards and Codes on the following topics: Banking Supervision and Securities Regulation, IMF Country Report No. 09/64, 65 pages.

KNIGHT T. AND HOSSAIN F., (2008), Helping the Needy: Factors Influencing the Development of Microfinance in Barbados, BWPI Working Paper 29, Brooks World Poverty Institute, 16 pages.

KOTLER P., ARMSTRONG G., WONG V. and SAUNDERS J.A., (2008), Principles of marketing, Pearson Education, Prentice Hall, 1020 pages.

LABIE M., (2009), Microfinance: évolutions du secteur, diversification des produits et gouvernance; *Reflets et Perspectives de la vie économique*; Tome XLVII no 3, pages 5-6.

LASHLEY J., (2004), Microfinance and Poverty Alleviation in the Caribbean. A Strategic Overview, *Journal of Microfinance*, pages 83-94.

LEE J.-J. and SAWADA Y., (2010), Precautionary saving under liquidity constraints: Evidence from rural Pakistan, *Journal of Development Economics*, Volume 91, Issue 1, Pages 77-86.

MORGAN D., (2010), Women Empowered by financial Equality, Saturday Sun Three pages Special, 3 July, pages 16-18.

PARKS W. and ROSSEL-CAMBIER K. (2008), Small Islands Development States (SIDS) Fit for Children Network. A Concept Note, UNICEF Pacific and the Eastern Caribbean Offices, 22 pages, accessible at: http://www.unicef.org/pacificislands/Paper_1_SIDS_ff.pdf

PUNNETT B., DICK-FORDE E. and ROBINSON J., (2006) 'Effective Management and Culture: An Analysis of Three English-Speaking Caribbean Countries', *Journal of Eastern Caribbean Studies*. 31, pages 44 – 71.

ROSSEL-CAMBIER K., (2010), Do Multiple Financial Services Enhance the Poverty Outreach of Microfinance Institutions?, *Working Paper Centre de Recherche Warocqué - CERMI*, Université de Mons, 2010/8, 39 pages.

ROSSEL-CAMBIER K., (2010), Does Combining Credit with Insurance or Savings Enhance the Organizational Performance of Microfinance Institutions?, *Working Paper Centre de Recherche Warocqué - CERMI*, Université de Mons, 2010/6, 32 pages.

ROSSEL-CAMBIER K., (2009), La microfinance combinée : aperçu en Amérique latine et dans les Caraïbes," *Reflets et perspectives de la vie économique*, De Boeck Université, vol. 0(3), pages 85-97.

ROSSEL-CAMBIER K., (2008). Combined Micro-Finance: Selected Research Questions from a Stakeholder Point of View, *Working Paper Working Paper Centre de Recherche Warocqué - CERMI*, Université de Mons, 2010/8, 2008-3, - *Working Paper CEB*, 08-004.RS, ULB -- Université Libre de Bruxelles, 34 pages.

ROSSEL-CAMBIER K., OLSEN T. and POURZAND N., (2007), Investing in knowledge for evidence-based social policies for children: Two case studies of knowledge dissemination initiatives in the Eastern Caribbean, *Knowledge Management for Development Journal*, 3 (2-3), pages 74-84.

RYDER P., (2002). Credit unions and financial exclusion: the odd couple? *Journal of Social Welfare and Family Law*, 24 (4), pages 423–434.

The SEEP network, (2005), *Measuring Performance of Microfinance Institutions: A Framework for Reporting, Analysis, and Monitoring*, 105 pages.

USAID, (2004), "Caribbean Financial Sector Assessment," prepared by Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Emerging Markets Ltd., United States Agency for International Development, Washington, D.C., 114 pages.

UNDP, (2009), *Human Development Report. Overcoming barriers: Human mobility and development*, 217 pages.

WENNER M. AND CHALMERS G., (2001) *Microfinance Issues and Challenges in the Anglophone Caribbean*, Working Paper. Inter-American Development Bank, Sustainable Development Department: Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise Division, Washington, D.C., 27 pages.

WESTLEY, G.D. (2005), *Microfinance in the Caribbean: How to Go Further*, Inter-American Development Bank, *Sustainable Development Department Technical Papers Series*, IADB, Washington, D.C. 37 pages.

Websites consulted

<http://www.bdsfinance.com/rural-enterprise-development-fund/>

http://www.gov.bb/portal/page/portal/BIG_Portal_Home_Page/BIG_Government_Channel_Page/BIG_GOV_Laws_of_Barbados

<http://www.coopmed.com/col/index.html>

<http://data.un.org/CountryProfile.aspx?crName=Barbados>

http://www.socialcare.gov.bb/default.asp?V_DOC_ID=1172

http://www.bidc.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=46&Itemid=113

http://www.fundaccess.org/about_us.html#

http://www.youthbusiness.bb/cms/index.php?option=com_frontpage&Itemid=1

<http://www.cobcreditunion.com/site/index.php>

<http://www.publicworkers.bb/>

<http://www.lexadin.nl/wlg/legis/nofr/oeur/lxwebar.htm>

<http://www.commerce.gov.bb/agency/Coop/default.asp>

<http://data.centralbank.org.bb/>